



ISO

International Organization for Standardization

???

title of national standards body

national committee
title
ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32
Data Management and Interchange
WG 3
Database Languages

Project: 32.03.xx.xx.xx.xx

Title: WG3 Standing Document Number 6: Template for Submission of Ballot Comments

Status: Standing Document for ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32/WG 3

Author: Jim Melton (USA)

Abstract: ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32/WG 3 has responsibility for a number of projects, some comprising multiple subprojects. When ballots are held for these projects, the Editing Meetings are made more tenable if a single document collecting all National Body ballot comments is available. This Standing Document is made available as an aid to National Bodies in preparing their ballot comments in a fashion making it feasible for a collected comments document to be prepared quickly and accurately. This revision of this Standing Document mandates the use of the Word template for ballot comment submission.

Introduction

This document contains a Microsoft Word template for use in preparing National Body comments in response to various ballots on Committee Drafts and Draft International Standards for Database Language SQL.

Important Message to Readers: Throughout the present paper, the phrase “National Body” appears in many places. Of course, comments are often (usually) prepared within National Bodies by individual participants (individuals or organizations). Such comments prepared within National Bodies can, of course, be prepared using the template provided in the present paper. When such comments are being produced within a National Body, the phrase “National Body” can be interpreted to mean “participant”, so that (for example) the “unique National Body identifier” mentioned below could be used as a “unique participant identifier” — obviously, each National Body will assign a true unique National Body identifier to those comments that it chooses to submit to the ISO ballot.

National Bodies are urgently requested to submit their comments in a more useable form than “plain text” and are invited to use the template, based on Microsoft Word, provided in this Standing Document, so that all National Body comments can be merged together into a single document containing the collected comments for use at Editing Meetings. Doing so will significantly ease the pain associated with creating the collected comments document and thereby speed up that creation.

Please note that this document was created using Microsoft Word 2000, and presumes the use of, Microsoft Word version 6.0, 7.0 (Word95), 8.0 (Word97), 9.0 (Word2000), or 10.0 (Word2003). Although we cannot mandate the use of any specific products in our standardization activities, use of this particular product will greatly aid in the timely production of the collected comments documents that have proved so beneficial to our Editing Meetings. Of course, if any National Body is unable to use this preferred format, the producer of the collected comments documents will to the best of his or her ability nonetheless convert those National Bodies’ comments and include them into the documents.

The Template (a/k/a “Word template”)

This template should be used by all National Bodies able to do so. This template, which the present paper will call the “Word template”, permits National Bodies to submit their comments in a form that can be easily merged into the collected comments documents with their tabular format. In the table used to record National Body Comments in this template, there are several columns. The meanings of those columns, and suggested uses, are as follows:

1. The first column, **SEQ#**, should be left blank, as it will be used only in the collected comments document. This value will be assigned by the collected comments editor, who will make every effort to cause the value to be stable across multiple versions of the same collected

ISO/IEC JTC1/SC32/WG3 SD-006_2004-07-11

comments document.

9. The second column, **Cmnt ID**, should be completed by each National Body to assign a unique National Body identifier to each comment being submitted by the National Body. The font used in this column should be Times New Roman, at 9 point. The format of the values in this column should be **nbc-P##-seq#**, where:

- a) “**nbc**” is a 3-letter code uniquely identifying the National Body, such as:

AUS = Australia

AUT = Austria

BEL = Belgium

CAN = Canada

CHN = China

CZE = Czech Republic

DEU = Germany (Deutschland)

DNK = Denmark

ESP = Spain (España)

FIN = Finland

FRA = France

GBR = United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland

ITA = Italy

JPN = Japan

KOR = Korea

NLD = Netherlands

NOR = Norway

RUS = Russian Federation

SWE = Sweden

USA = United States of America

These values are taken from ISO 3166, a standard for 3-character (and 2-character) country names. To illustrate this point, we have chosen (we think all) countries that have sent representatives to SC32/WG3, SC32 WG4, or their predecessors (SC21/WG3/DBL RG and SQL/MM RG) at least one time.

ISO/IEC JTC1/SC32/WG3 SD-006_2004-07-11

Within a National Body (e.g., NCITS in the USA), this 3-character code should be replaced by a 3-character code designating the member organization submitting comments to the National Body. (For example, IBM for IBM Corp., ORA for Oracle, or WIS for Whitemarsh Information Systems)

b) “**P##**” is a code indicating the part of the SQL standard to which the comment applies. The values should be:

P01 = SQL/Framework

P02 = SQL/Foundation

P03 = SQL/CLI

P04 = SQL/PSM

P09 = SQL/MED

P10 = SQL/OLB

P11 = SQL/Schemata

P13 = SQL/JRT

P14 = SQL/XML

A0n = SQL/??? (Amendment n) (if and when relevant)

STC = SQL Technical Corregendum

In other words, the code is either (1) an upper-case letter “P” followed by a 2-digit number corresponding to the part number, with an explicit leading zero (to accommodate part numbers greater than 9 while ensuring correct sorting), *or* (2) an upper-case letter “A” followed by a 2-digit number corresponding to the amendment number, *or* (3) an upper-case letter “S” followed by an upper-case letter “T” followed by an upper-case letter “C”. Note that part numbers P05, P06, P07, P08, and P12 are obsolete and retired.

c) “**seq#**” is a 3-digit sequence number, with required leading zeros, assigned to the comment by the National Body, indicating the number of the comment on the specified part by the specified National Body. The required leading zeros permit these numbers to sort correctly.

10. The third column, **See Also**, may be left blank, or the National Body may choose to insert the **Cmnt ID** value associated with other comments by the same National Body that relate to the comment being entered. The font used in this column should be Times New Roman, at 9 point.

11. The fourth column, **Severity**, should be in the font Times New Roman, at 9 point, and should be one of the following values:

1-Major Technical

ISO/IEC JTC1/SC32/WG3 SD-006_2004-07-11

2-Minor Technical

3-Major Editorial

The presence of the leading “1-”, “2-”, or “3-”, in addition to the words, permits these severity indicators to sort appropriately. **Please use the full string, including that leading digit and hyphen!** While purely minor editorial comments should be generally sent directly to the document Editor for action, it may sometimes be absolutely necessary to include such comments in ballots. In that case, the value for the **Severity** column should be:

4-Minor Editorial

12. The fifth column, **Reference**, identifies the specific document to which the comment applies and to the location in the document to which it applies. The font used in this column should be Times New Roman italics, at 9 point. The format should be “**P##-cc.nn.nn, title**” where:

a) “**P##**” is a code indicating the part of the SQL standard to which the comment applies. The values should be:

P01 = SQL/Framework

P02 = SQL/Foundation

P03 = SQL/CLI

P04 = SQL/PSM

P09 = SQL/MED

P10 = SQL/OLB

P11 = SQL/Schemata

P13 = SQL/JRT

P14 = SQL/XML

A0n = SQL/??? (Amendment m) (if and when relevant)

STC = SQL Technical Corregendum

Note that this is identical to the “**P##**” value in the **Cmnt ID** column described above.

b) “**cc**” identifies a Clause number, with a leading zero if required to make the Clause number occupy 2 digits and prohibited otherwise.

ISO/IEC JTC1/SC32/WG3 SD-006_2004-07-11

- c) “**nn**” identifies a Subclause number within the Clause, again with a leading zero if required to make the Clause number occupy 2 digits and prohibited otherwise. Note that some comments might have only Clause numbers, while others might have several levels of Subclause number nesting (with a full stop, or period, separating the levels).
- d) “**title**” is the Clause or Subclause title as specified in the appropriate document; please ensure that it is spelled correctly and completely, including capitalization and punctuation (such as, but not limited to, angle brackets). Following these conventions will help ensure that the References will sort correctly. However, qualifying words such as “Clause” or “Subclause” should *not* be included. The comma between the number and the title *must be* included!
- e) No indication of paragraph number, rule number, etc. should be included in this Reference column. If the comment refers to a specific paragraph or rule number, then that information should be contained in the comment itself, in the **Description** column.

If the reference does not apply to a specific Clause or Subclause (or, indeed, part) in the specifications, then the phrase “No specific location” should be used in this column. If the comment applies to a specific part of SQL, but not to a specific Clause or Subclause, then a reference like “P02-No specific location” should be used. If the comment applies to a specific part of SQL, and to a specific Clause but not to a specific Subclause, then a reference like “P02-nn.No specific location” should be used (where “nn” is the Clause number).

- 13. The sixth column, **Description**, should contain two sections. The first, starting immediately at the beginning of the column, should be a textual description of the comment being submitted by the National Body. This text may be in any form, with WYSIWYG aspects if required to get the message of the comment to the reader, and with multiple paragraphs if so required. It should be followed by a line with the word “**Solution**” in Times New Roman, 12 point, boldface, centered in the column. After that line, the National Body may choose to insert additional text specifying the solution to their comment; alternatively, the text “None supplied with comment” may be inserted. The font used in this column (except for the centered line “**Solution**”) should be Times New Roman, at 10 point. While blank lines may be used to separate paragraphs or sections within the comment or within the proposed solution, there should be no blank line appearing immediately prior to or following the line containing the single word “**Solution**”.
- 14. The seventh and final column, **Addressed By**, should normally be left blank; however, if the National Body has provided a solution with their comment, then they are encouraged to put the string “See Comment” into the **Addressed By** column. If the National Body has provided a separately numbered paper containing a proposal that addresses the comment, then they are encouraged to put that paper’s number into the **Addressed By** column. If multiple comments from the National Body are addressed by a solution provided with one of those comments, then the **Addressed By** column could contain the **Cmnt ID** value of the comment containing the common solution. The font used in this column should be Times New Roman, at 9 point.

ISO/IEC JTC1/SC32/WG3 SD-006_2004-07-11

The table on the next page of this paper contains some sample entries that we hope will illustrate the conventions suggested above. Please use the table *exactly* as shown, including the precise widths of the columns, the Word styles of the columns, and so forth. The best way to accomplish this is to select and copy the table into a new document that will contain the National Body's comments, then copy the rows as many times as required to include all of those comments.

Please note that the rows in the table that contain Major Technical comments should always be entirely colored yellow to draw the Ballot Resolution Meeting's attention to those comments.

When comments are addressed, the **Addressed By** column will be given one of the following entries to indicate the degree to which the comment has been addressed:

RESOLVED ☺
CLOSE PP☺
ADD PP ☺
RETAIN ☺
MAKE LO ☺

To maximize the convenience to those individuals and National Bodies writing comments, this Standing Document is accompanied by a Word file whose file name is identical to the file name of the Standing Document, except that the sequence “-Template” has been inserted prior to the date indicator. For example, the template file name might be SD-006-2004-07-11.dot

ISO/IEC JTC1/SC32/WG3 SD-006_2004-07-11

SEQ #	Cmnt ID	See Also	Severity	Reference	Description	Addressed By
SQL/{document name}						
			1-Major Technical		<p>Solution</p> <p>None provided with comment.</p>	
			1-Major Technical	<i>Pnn-No specific location</i>	<p>All Possible Problems and Editor's Notes must be satisfactorily resolved and all problems discovered during the course of the ballot resolution process must be satisfactorily resolved.</p> <p>Solution</p> <p>None provided with comment.</p>	
			2-Minor Technical		<p>Solution</p> <p>None provided with comment.</p>	
			3-Major Editorial		<p>Solution</p> <p>None provided with comment.</p>	
			4-Minor Editorial		<p>Solution</p> <p>None provided with comment.</p>	
SQL/{document name}						
			1-Major Technical		<p>Solution</p> <p>None provided with comment.</p>	
			1-Major Technical	<i>Pnn-No specific location</i>	<p>All Possible Problems and Editor's Notes must be satisfactorily resolved and all problems discovered during the course of the ballot resolution process must be satisfactorily resolved.</p> <p>Solution</p> <p>None provided with comment.</p>	
			2-Minor Technical		<p>Solution</p> <p>None provided with comment.</p>	
			3-Major Editorial		<p>Solution</p> <p>None provided with comment.</p>	
			4-Minor			

ISO/IEC JTC1/SC32/WG3 SD-006_2004-07-11

SEQ #	Cmnt ID	See Also	Severity	Reference	Description	Addressed By
			Editorial		None provided with comment. Solution	
SQL/{document name}						
			1-Major Technical		None provided with comment. Solution	
			1-Major Technical	<i>Pnn-No specific location</i>	All Possible Problems and Editor's Notes must be satisfactorily resolved and all problems discovered during the course of the ballot resolution process must be satisfactorily resolved. Solution None provided with comment.	
			2-Minor Technical		None provided with comment. Solution	
			3-Major Editorial		None provided with comment. Solution	
			4-Minor Editorial		None provided with comment. Solution	

End of Paper