

ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32 N 1932

Date: 2009-11-11

REPLACES: —

ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32

Data Management and Interchange

Secretariat: United States of America (ANSI)
Administered by Farance Inc. on behalf of ANSI

DOCUMENT TYPE	Disposition of Comments
TITLE	Disposition of comments in 32N1716 Summary of Voting on FCD 14957 Information technology - Representation of data elements values: Notation of the format 2nd Edition
SOURCE	WG2 - Frank Farance - Project Editor
PROJECT NUMBER	1.32.19.02.00.00
STATUS	Disposition of comments in SoV 32N1716 (comments on FCD 14957 ballot 32N1678). This accompanies 32N1931 FDIS 14957 sent to ITTF for FDIS ballot
REFERENCES	
ACTION ID.	FYI
REQUESTED ACTION	
DUE DATE	--
Number of Pages	8
LANGUAGE USED	English
DISTRIBUTION	P & L Members SC Chair WG Conveners and Secretaries

Dr. Timothy Schoechle, Secretary, ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32
Farance Inc *, 3066 Sixth Street, Boulder, CO, United States of America
Telephone: +1 303-443-5490; E-mail: Timothy@Schoechle.org
available from the JTC 1/SC 32 WebSite <http://www.jtc1sc32.org/>
*Farance Inc. administers the ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32 Secretariat on behalf of ANSI

ISO/IEC 14957 FCD Disposition of Comments

Date: 2009-11-10	Document: SC32 Nnnnn
------------------	-----------------------------

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table /Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Disposition of Comments
JP 01	<i>Clause 4</i>		ed	Terms "strol" and "strtod" should be changed to "strol()" and "strtod()" since they refer to C functions.		Agreed.
JP 02	<i>Clause 4</i>		ed	Definition of l need be defined at clause 4.		Agreed.
JP 03	<i>Annex A</i>		ed	"a" should be specified in Annex A.		Agreed.

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

ISO/IEC 14957 FCD Disposition of Comments

Date: 2009-11-10	SC32/Nnnnn
------------------	------------

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table /Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Disposition of Comments
GB	Introduction		ed	The purpose of the standard would be more obvious if the objective were stated in the first sentence of the introduction, rather than the last.	Move the last sentence, with appropriate modifications, to become the first	Agreed.
GB	1		te	The Scope clause gives no indication of the context in which this standard is intended to be applied. The body of the document, in particular clause 4, appears to assume that the format will be one operand of a function that extracts a value from a stream of characters and possibly stores that value somewhere. However, neither this nor any alternative assumption is made explicit.	Modify the Scope to identify explicitly the context in which the standard is expected to be used. Alternatively, it could be recast to be purely a means for the description of formats without any procedural implications.	Agreed.
GB	1	1	ed	The first sentence implies that the notation specified in this standard is to be used universally in all application fields. This is not the case as there are other standards that specify other notations, for example the POSIX standard and the SQL standard.	Modify the sentence to remove the implication of universality.	Agreed.
GB	1	2	ed	The intent of the second sentence of the Scope is not obvious. The standard defines a means of describing data elements, giving special functionality to a limited set of characters. It is unnecessary to identify at this point characters that are not so used.	Delete the second sentence.	Agreed,
GB	2		te	None of the four standards identified in Clause 2 are referenced in a normative way elsewhere in the document. Where there are references, they are informative, giving the source of definitions, or merely commentary, as with references in the Introduction. However, there are references in clause to "the strtol function" and "the strtod function", although neither function is defined or described in any way in the document.	Delete all four existing references. Add a reference for the definition of the functions strtol and strtod (probably either the C language standard or the POSIX standard).	Agreed.
GB	4	1	te	There is no definition of what constitutes a white space character nor of a directive.	Add definition of these two concepts.	Agreed.

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

ISO/IEC 14957 FCD Disposition of Comments

Date: 2009-11-10	SC32/Nnnnn
------------------	------------

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table /Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Disposition of Comments
GB	4		te	The Note following the first paragraph states that "This specification of formats is based upon the "fscanf()" function in the C programming language". If the C function is deficient in some way or has facilities that are not considered necessary for the purposes of this standard, this should be explained.		Agreed. Project Editor: Given to two choices for implementation, chose the non-service approach.
GB	4		te	Clause 4 appears to imply a processing model whereby the functionality defined in this standard is embedded in some undefined way in some unknown programming language. No mechanism for identification of the source character stream nor of any destination for extracted values is defined, although there are statements that arguments shall be pointers. Not all programming languages support pointers.	Modify the clause to make the specification independent of any particular programming language or style. Alternatively, recast the whole standard as a specification of a function in some specific programming language or languages.	Agreed.
GB	4		te	There is no indication of what happens if an error is detected or if processing fails for some other reason.	Supply the missing specifications.	Agreed. Project Editor: Added text to explain processing model, but the error handling of non-matching strings is unspecified and unnecessary (because it is a non-service specification).
GB	4		te	The recognition and conversion specifications appear to be defining functionality that is a subset of the regular expression functionality defined in other standards and authoritative documents, such as the POSIX standard and W3C publications. Consideration should be given to adopting regular expression definition techniques and also to extending the power of this standard by moving towards a more general description mechanism modelled on those employed in other current standards.		Ballot resolution meeting agreed that this was not necessary for this edition of the standard.

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

ISO/IEC 14957 FCD Disposition of Comments

Date: 2009-11-10	SC32/Nnnnn
------------------	------------

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table /Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Disposition of Comments
GB	Introduction		ed	The purpose of the standard would be more obvious if the objective were stated in the first sentence of the introduction, rather than the last.	Move the last sentence, with appropriate modifications, to become the first	Agreed.
GB	1		te	The Scope clause gives no indication of the context in which this standard is intended to be applied. The body of the document, in particular clause 4, appears to assume that the format will be one operand of a function that extracts a value from a stream of characters and possibly stores that value somewhere. However, neither this nor any alternative assumption is made explicit.	Modify the Scope to identify explicitly the context in which the standard is expected to be used. Alternatively, it could be recast to be purely a means for the description of formats without any procedural implications.	Agreed. Used ISO/IEC 11179 data element description as an illustration.
GB	1	1	ed	The first sentence implies that the notation specified in this standard is to be used universally in all application fields. This is not the case as there are other standards that specify other notations, for example the POSIX standard and the SQL standard.	Modify the sentence to remove the implication of universality.	Agreed.
GB	1	2	ed	The intent of the second sentence of the Scope is not obvious. The standard defines a means of describing data elements, giving special functionality to a limited set of characters. It is unnecessary to identify at this point characters that are not so used.	Delete the second sentence.	Agreed.
GB	2		te	None of the four standards identified in Clause 2 are referenced in a normative way elsewhere in the document. Where there are references, they are informative, giving the source of definitions, or merely commentary, as with references in the Introduction. However, there are references in clause to "the strtol function" and "the strtod function", although neither function is defined or described in any way in the document.	Delete all four existing references. Add a reference for the definition of the functions strtol and strtod (probably either the C language standard or the POSIX standard).	Agreed.
GB	4	1	te	There is no definition of what constitutes a white space character nor of a directive.	Add definition of these two concepts.	Agreed.

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

ISO/IEC 14957 FCD Disposition of Comments

Date: 2009-11-10	SC32/Nnnnn
------------------	------------

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table /Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Disposition of Comments
GB	4		te	The Note following the first paragraph states that "This specification of formats is based upon the "fscanf()" function in the C programming language". If the C function is deficient in some way or has facilities that are not considered necessary for the purposes of this standard, this should be explained.		See same comment above.
GB	4		te	Clause 4 appears to imply a processing model whereby the functionality defined in this standard is embedded in some undefined way in some unknown programming language. No mechanism for identification of the source character stream nor of any destination for extracted values is defined, although there are statements that arguments shall be pointers. Not all programming languages support pointers.	Modify the clause to make the specification independent of any particular programming language or style. Alternatively, recast the whole standard as a specification of a function in some specific programming language or languages.	Agreed. Project Editor: Chose the non-service approach.
GB	4		te	There is no indication of what happens if an error is detected or if processing fails for some other reason.	Supply the missing specifications.	Agreed. Project Editor: Given other comments and the choice of a non-service specification (e.g., no description of a function call), error handling is unspecified and unnecessary.
GB	4		te	The recognition and conversion specifications appear to be defining functionality that is a subset of the regular expression functionality defined in other standards and authoritative documents, such as the POSIX standard and W3C publications. Consideration should be given to adopting regular expression definition techniques and also to extending the power of this standard by moving towards a more general description mechanism modelled on those employed in other current standards.		See above.

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

0	1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
#	NB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table / Note #	Com- ment type ²	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
1	US	0		ed	Remove references to standards that have little impact on current edition, and include full name for standards that continue to be referenced.	Change as appropriate.	Agreed.
2	US	2		te	Remove references to 11179 and 19763. Add reference to 9899 (C Programming language) and 11404 (general purpose datatypes)		Agreed.
3	US	4		te	Discussion of assignment and context in which assignment is relevant.	Add explanation as appropriate.	Agreed.
4	US	4		te	Include format specifiers for all 11404 primitive datatypes.	Add specifier for date-time, scaled, and other primitive 11404 datatypes	Agreed. Project Editor: After subsequent review, the remaining 11404 datatypes were not added because this would involve a substantial rewrite of the document "to do the job right". This change should be considered for the next edition.
5	US	4	Examples	ed	Add examples for all type specifiers		Agreed. Project Editor: Examples were removed in Clause 5 and moved to Clause 4 next to each directive type.
6	US	4	Examples	ed	For each example, give examples that match and examples that don't match the format specifiers		Agreed.
7	US	5		te	Add Note explaining certain format sequences, such as %d0, will never match any string		Agreed,
8	US	Annex A		te	EBNF operator after "*" should be vertical bar (), not comma (,).		Agreed.

1 NB = National body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the Secretariat editing unit are identified by **)

2 Type of comment: ge = general te = technical ed = editorial NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory. ISO electronic balloting commenting template (enhanced 2002-08)

ISO/IEC 14957 FCD Disposition of Comments

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table /Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
	1	first sentence	ed	first sentence unclear	insert a comma after "character classes" (?) to clarify the sentence: "This International Standard specifies the notation to be used for stating the format, i.e the character classes, used in the representation..."	
	2		ed	Documents listed as normative references shall be cited elsewhere in the document in a way which indicates that the user is required to consult them in order to apply ISO/IEC 14957. None of the documents listed in Clause 2 is cited in this way.	Move ISO/IEC 2382-04, ISO/IEC 6093, ISO/IEC 11179-3 and ISO/IEC 19773-001 to a bibliography at the end of the document.	
	3		ed	Source of definition shall be given in square brackets beneath the definition.	Move the source to the next line. Replace "04" with "4".	
	2	fourth reference	ed	Incorrect ISO/IEC reference and title given.	Correct document reference to ISO/IEC 19773-1, replace title with "Information technology -- MetaData Registries (MDR) -- Part 1: Contact information module for metamodel".	

1 MB = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 Type of comment: ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.