

ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32 N 1752

Date: 2008-05-27

REPLACES: _____

ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32

Data Management and Interchange

Secretariat: United States of America (ANSI)
Administered by Farance Inc. on behalf of ANSI

DOCUMENT TYPE	Disposition of Comments
TITLE	Disposition of comments in 32N1622 Summary of Voting on CD3 20944-1 - Information technology - Metadata Registry Interoperability and Bindings (MDR-IB) Part 1: Framework, common vocabulary, and common provisions for conformance
SOURCE	WG2 - Frank Farance - Project Editor
PROJECT NUMBER	1.32.17.01.01.00
STATUS	Disposition of comments in 32N1622 (comments on CD 20944-1 ballot 32N1569). This accompanies FCD 20944-1 sent to NBs for 4 month letter ballot.
REFERENCES	
ACTION ID.	FYI
REQUESTED ACTION	
DUE DATE	
Number of Pages	6
LANGUAGE USED	English
DISTRIBUTION	P & L Members SC Chair WG Conveners and Secretaries

Dr. Timothy Schoechle, Secretary, ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32
Farance Inc *, 3066 Sixth Street, Boulder, CO, United States of America
Telephone: +1 303-443-5490; E-mail: Timothy@Schoechle.org
available from the JTC 1/SC 32 WebSite <http://www.jtc1sc32.org/>
*Farance Inc. administers the ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32 Secretariat on behalf of ANSI

Disposition of Canadian Comments on SC32 N1569 CD3 20944-1

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2007-12-04

Document: ISO/IEC CD3 20944-1

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table /Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment 2	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Disposition of Comments
CA 01	1.1	Footnote 1	Ed	<p>The terms "<i>data interoperability</i>" and "<i>metadata interoperability</i>" are used in a footnote to clause 1. Since these concepts are fundamental to this family of standards, the terms and their definitions should be included in clause 3.</p> <p>(Comment from previous two ballots still not applied.)</p>	Add definitions of " <i>data interoperability</i> " and " <i>metadata interoperability</i> " to clause 3.	Will make requested change.
CA 02	1.2.1	para 1	Te	<p>The document states: it is <i>impossible to determine, independent of context and relationships</i>, that any piece of data is actually also metadata. The implication is: metadata interchange is no different than data interchange.</p> <p>We disagree with the stated implication. On the contrary, the implication is that if metadata interchange is treated as no different from data interchange, then the associated context and relationships will be lost, and you will end up exchanging data only, and not metadata.</p> <p>We do not propose that this standard do anything differently, other than to provide a clear statement that users be aware of this implication.</p>	<p>Replace the sentence that begins 'The implication is' by:</p> <p>'The implications are: (1) because metadata is data, it can be exchanged like other data, but (2) to remain metadata, the exchange must include the associated context and relationships.'</p>	Will make requested change.
CA 03	1.3	Para 1. line 1	ed	A space is missing after 'Part 1' at the beginning of the second sentence.	Insert the missing space.	Will make requested change.
CA 04	3	All	ed	In Bugzilla issue 268 Canada provided WG2 N0945, a partial list of terms defined in clause 3 that are not used and should therefore be deleted. We have not yet had the opportunity to complete this exercise, nor to review which of there recommendations have still to be acted on.	Canada will submit a revised list for consideration, either to the editing meeting, or in response to the FCD ballot.	Will wait until FCD ballot.

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2007-12-04

Document: ISO/IEC CD3 20944-1

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table /Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment 2	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Disposition of Comments
CA 05	3.12.5	subclause title	ed	The sub-clause title 'Data network' is duplicated from the previous sub-clause. The title of this sub-clause should be 'User facilities'. [This is comment from the last two ballots that has still not been applied!]	Change the sub-clause title to 'User facilities'	Will make requested change.
CA 06	6.2	para 1	ed	The first paragraph of sub-clause 6.2 is identical to the first paragraph of sub-clause 6.1. [This comment is Bugzilla issue 270 .]	Remove the duplication, and rewrite as necessary. The simplest solution is to delete para 1 of 6.2, but this may not be the best solution.	Will make requested change.
CA 07	6.2	various	ed	In the example code, all uses of the prefix 'mdib' should be 'mdrib'. [This comment is Bugzilla issue 271 .]	Change all instances of mdib to mdrib.	Will make requested change.
CA 08	6.3	Example	ed	In line 2 of the example 'fro' s/b 'from'	Change 'fro' to 'from'.	Will make requested change.

SEQ #	Cmnt ID	See Also	Severity	Reference	Description	Disposition of Comments
ISO/IEC 2nd CD 19763-1						
001	JPN-P01-001		General	General	This project consolidation and its CD ballot resolution are grounded on only the WG2 resolutions at Huntsville, which have not yet authorized by the SC32 level resolution. So, this consolidated project is not yet initiated and cannot go to the CD stage. So, this CD ballot is void. See 6.2.2.1 and Item 3, 12.5.7, ISO/IEC JTC1 N8105 ISO/IEC JTC 1 Directives, 5th Edition, Version 1.0	Resolved at 2007-07 WG2 meeting.
002	JPN-P01-002		General	General	32N1569B-ballot for CD3 24944-1 says "Date of circulation: 2007-04-20, Closing date: 2007-07-15". However, 9.4.1, ISO/IEC JTC1 N8105 ISO/IEC JTC 1 Directives, 5th Edition, Version 1.0 says "In the case of CDs/PDAMs/PDISPs/PDTRs, this date should be no less than three months from the date of notification of issue." So, the closing date shall be after 2007-07-20.	Resolved at 2007-07 WG2 meeting.

End of Paper

2	(3)	4	5		(6)	(7)
Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table /Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB		Proposed change by the MB	Disposition of Comments
GB	General		ge	This CD is not structured according to ISO/IEC drafting rules.		Unclear what is request
GB	1.2, 1.4		ed	It is not appropriate for this material to be in a Scope clause; it should either be in the body of the standard or in an Annex.		Given common misconceptions about d metadata, and interoperability, these subclauses are necess: understanding the scop
GB	3		ed	Many of the definitions included in this clause are in common use and do not, therefore, need to be included in this draft standard.		Will review again after F ballot.

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Disposition of US Comments on CD3 Text For: ISO/IEC 20944, Information technology — Metadata Registries Interoperability and Bindings (MDR-IB) — Part 1: Framework, common vocabulary, and common provisions for conformance

Date: 2007-12-04

Document: **xxx**

0	1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
#	NB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table / Note #	Comment type ²	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Proposed Disposition of Comments
0001	US	3.16.1		te	The term datatype is defined twice in 3.16.1. Neither definition is sourced.		Will make requested change.
0002	US	3.20.12.20		te	The notes under 3.20.12.20 appear misplaced.		Will make requested change.
0003	US	3		te	The term session (used in definitions 3.6.1.28-29 and in clause 6.2) is not defined—neither here, nor in Part 3.		Will make requested change.
0004	US	6.2		ed	Typo, product->produce		Will make requested change.

¹ **NB** = National body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the Secretariat editing unit are identified by **)

² **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial **NOTE** Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory. *ISO electronic balloting commenting template (enhanced 2002-08)*