ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32 N 0366

Date: 1999-10-22 REPLACES: --

ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32

Data Management and Interchange

Secretariat: United States of America (ANSI)
Administered by Pacific Northwest National Laboratory on behalf of ANSI

DOCUMENT TYPE	Meeting Report
TITLE	Minutes of the SQL/MED CD Continution Editing Meeting - Loene A/D Vecht, Netherlands, Oct 4 - 15, 1999
SOURCE	Paul Cotton (Canada)
PROJECT NUMBER	03.04.09.00.00
STATUS	Output document from CD Editing Meeting
REFERENCES	
ACTION ID.	FYI
REQUESTED ACTION	
DUE DATE	
Number of Pages	22
LANGUAGE USED	English
DISTRIBUTION	P & L Members
	SC Chair
	WG Conveners and Secretaries

Douglas Mann, Secretariat, ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32

Pacific Northwest National Laboratory *, 901 D Street, SW., Suite 900, Washington, DC, 20024-2115, United States of America

Telephone: +1 703 575 2114; Facsimile; +1 703 681 9180; E-mail: MannD@battelle.org

^{*}Pacific Northwest National Laboratory (PNL) administers the ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32 Secretariat on behalf of ANSI

ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32 N0366 WG3 SAF-013

Date: Oct 15, 1999

ISO

International Organization for Standardization

ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32 Data Management and Services WG3 Database Languages

Secretariat: USA (ANSI)

Title: Minutes of the SQL/MED CD Continution Editing Meeting

Loene A/D Vecht, Netherlands, Oct 4 - 15, 1999

Author: Paul Cotton (Canada)

Status: Output document from CD Editing Meeting

SECTION	PAGE
1 INTRODUCTION OF PARTICIPANTS	3
2 DISTRIBUTION OF DOCUMENTS	3
3 SELECTION OF SECRETARY AND RESOLUTION RECORDER	3
4 APPROVAL OF AGENDA	3
5 ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS	3
6 NATIONAL BODY OPENING COMMENTS	4
7 RESOLUTION OF BALLOT COMMENTS	5
8 RESOLUTION OF CATCH-ALL BALLOT COMMENTS	11
9 NATIONAL BODY CLOSING COMMENTS	12
10 RECOMMENDATIONS	13
11 ACTION ITEMS	14
12 ADJOURN	14
APPENDIX A FINAL AGENDA	15
APPENDIX B. DOCUMENT REGISTER	18

The meeting started at 9:00 AM on Monday October 4, 1999 at James Martin & Co. in Loenen a/d Vecht, Netherlands. . Stephen Cannan was in the chair.

1 Introduction Of Participants

Phil Brown (UK) Charles Campbell (USA)

Stephen Cannan (Netherlands) WG3 Convenor

Paul Cotton (Canada) Hugh Darwen (UK)

Rüdiger Eisele (Germany) (attended Mon-Fri Oct 4-8)
Mark Greaves (UK) (attended on Wed-Thu October 13-14)
Lex De Han (Netherlands) (attended on Thu Oct 14)
Helge Jacobsen (Germany) (attended on Thu Oct 14)

Takashi Kotera (Japan) Krishna Kulkarni (USA)

Jim Melton (USA) Project Editor

Peter Pistor (Germany) Masashi Tsuchida (Japan) Fred Zemke (USA)

2 Distribution Of Documents

All participants either had or were provided with all documents on the document register.

3 Selection Of Secretary And Resolution Recorder

Paul Cotton agreed to record the minutes. RTM-017R3 was tabled by Jim Melton as a draft disposition of the SQL/MED ballot comments..

It was agreed that these minutes (WG3 SAF-013), a revised version of disposition of the SQL/MED comments document (WG3 SAF-015), and a revised text for SQL/MED (WG3 SAG-017) would document the results of this CD editing meeting.

Jim Melton agreed to record the resolutions of the editing meeting.

4 Approval Of Agenda

The original agenda for this meeting was published as SC32/WG3 N0023. The agenda was amended to include all of the tabled papers.

The final agenda can be found in Appendix A. The final document register can be found in Appendix B.

5 Administrative Matters

5.1 Calling notice for MED Continuation Editing Meeting (SC32 N00316) (RTM-022)

Noted.

5.2 Minutes of ISO 9075-9 SQL/MED CD Editing Meeting, Matsue (SC32 N00288, RTM-015)

Adopted unanimously.

5.3 CD 9075-9 SQL/MED Interim Text (RTM-013)

Noted.

5.4 CD 9075-9 SQL/MED Interim Disposition of Comments (RTM-017R3)

Noted.

5.5 Convenor's Definition of Consensus

The Convenor stated that a simple majority would be used to decide a paper that simply fixes a problem.

But the Convenor felt that for papers that remove or add new functionality, a consensus will be defined to be a majority of at least two votes. The Convenor will take into consideration any abstentions in determining the minimum number of yes votes in order to define a consensus. The Convenor would like a majority of the countries present to be voting Yes in this case.

6 National Body Opening Comments

Canada

Canada has reviewed the USA SQL/MED submissions (RTM-056, RTM-057 and RTM-058) and have both technical and editorial comments on these three papers. We are pleased to see the number of papers on the Datalink aspect of SQL/MED and Canada is ready to adopt RTM-045 to remove the Abstract LOB material from the base document.

Germany

Germany is very interested in a swift progression of MED. We believe that the papers on the table represent a reasonable set of functionality, and that we should concentrate now on resolving the remaining problems.

Japan

No specific opening comments.

Netherlands

Netherlands is encouraged to see that there are papers available to resolve about two-third of the remaining SQL/MED ballot comments. Netherlands hopes then that we can thus resolve the bulk of the SQL/MED ballot comments at this meeting. Netherlands believes that we have additional work to do to conform to the agreement with WG5 as manifested WG3 YGJ-113.

United Kingdom

We note several obstacles to progression of SQL/MED to FCD ballot out of Loenen: (a) the outstanding issue of "access tokens" and interface between DBMS and "Linker"; (b) substantial new contributions (rtm056, 57 and 58) which appear to need further work and time for proper scrutiny and comment; and (c) the date of ballot resolution meeting would appear to be unaffected by choice of whether we progress out of Loenen or Santa Fé. We bring some comment addressing papers, especially rtm045 to delete the problem-ridden abstract LOB facility, and rtm044 <datalink length> issues.

USA

USA is pleased with the progress made in resolving a fair number of SQL/MED CD ballot comments at Matsue. We have three more significant contributions that address substantial issues for this meeting (RTM-056, 057, and 058). We are also hoping to table few more papers during the meeting. With a number of contributions from other national bodies, (especially UK), we are confident that the majority of the ballot comments will have been resolved by the end of this meeting. USA hopes that this Editing meeting will produce a recommendation to progress SQL/MED to FCD ballot as soon as the revised documents are ready.

7 Resolution of Ballot Comments

7.1 Seq#011 (USA-P09-001) (RTM-045)

See agenda item 7.2.

7.2 Seq#013 (DEU-P09-001) (RTM-045)

RTM-045 was amended as follows:

a) In Scope, delete the text ", abstract large objects (LOBS),"

RTM-045 resolves the following ballot comments

Seq#011 (USA-P03-001) see agenda item 7.1

Seg#013 (DEU-P09-082)

Seq#014 (GBR-P09-002)

Seq#015 (DEU-P09-002)

Seq#016 (USA-P09-003)

Seq#048 (CAN-P09-018)

Seq#049 (CAN-P09-019)

Seq#050 (DEU-P09-008)

Seq#052 (DEU-P09-010)

Seq#054 (USA-P09-011)

Seq#105 (CAN-P09-009)

Seq#106 (CAN-P09-030)

Seq#107 (CAN-P09-031)

Seq#108 (CAN-P09-032)

Seq#109 (CAN-P09-033)

Seq#110 (CAN-P09-034)

Seq#111 (CAN-P09-036)

Seq#112 (CAN-P09-038)

Seq#113 (CAN-P09-039)

Seq#114 (CAN-P09-040)

Seq#115 (CAN-P09-041)

Seq#116 (CAN-P09-042)

Seq#117 (CAN-P09-043)

Seg#118 (CAN-P09-044)

Seq#119 (GBR-P09-032)

Seq#120 (GBR-P09-033) Seq#121 (GBR-P09-034)

Seq#121 (GBR-P09-034) Seq#122 (GBR-P09-035)

Seg#123 (GBR-P09-042)

3eq#123 (GBR-109-042)

Seq#124 (GBR-P09-043) Seq#125 (GBR-P09-046)

Seq#123 (GBR-107-040)

Seq#126 (GBR-P09-048)

Seq#127 (GBR-P09-049)

Seq#128 (GBR-P09-050)

Seq#129 (GBR-P09-051)

Seq#130 (GBR-P09-057)

Seq#131 (GBR-P09-060)

Seq#133 (USA-P09-020)

Seq#134 (USA-P09-021)

Seq#135 (USA-P09-034)

Seq#136 (GBR-P09-036)

Seq#137 (GBR-P09-037)

Seq#138 (GBR-P09-038)

```
Seq#139 (GBR-P09-040)
Seg#140 (GBR-P09-052)
Seg#145 (USA-P09-022)
Seq#146 (USA-P09-023)
Seq#147 (USA-P09-024) see agenda item 7.14
Seg#148 (USA-P09-025) see agenda item 7.15
Seq#149 (USA-P09-026) see agenda item 7.16
Seq#150 (USA-P09-027)
Seg#154 (GBR-P09-047)
Seq#155 (GBR-P09-055)
Seq#156 (USA-P09-031)
Seg#157 (USA-P09-032)
Seq#162 (GBR-P09-044)
Seq#163 (GBR-P09-045)
Seq#236 (CAN-P09-062) see agenda item 7.20
Seq#237 (USA-P09-052)
Seq#238 (DEU-P09-022)
Seq#240 (GBR-P09-094)
RTM-045 partially resolves the following ballot comments:
```

- a) Seq#278 (CAN-P09-082)
- b) Seq#281 (CAN-P09-085) (see also RTM-044 agenda item 7.7)
- c) Seq#282 (GBR-P09-100)

RTM-115 was adopted unanimously and completes the resolution of the following ballot comments:

- a) Seq#281 (CAN-P09-085) (see also RTM-044 agenda item 7.7)
- b) Seq#282 (GBR-P09-100)

RTM-119R2 was amended as follows:

- a) in section 6.3, delete the last line of the proposed Table 2.
- b) in section 6.13, description 1, change "FOREIGN TABLE" to "FOREIGN"
- c) in section 6.13, add ", FOREIGN" to the list of alternative values in the constraint

TABLE_TYPE_CHECK.

RTM-019R2 was adopted unanimously and completes the resolution of the following ballot comments: a) Seq#278 (CAN-P09-082)

7.3 Seq#035 (GBR-P09-101) (RTM-067) (RTM-096R1)

UK supported the solution in RTM-067. Canada, Germany, Japan, Netherlands and USA supported RTM-096R1.

Adoption of RTM-096R1 resolves ballot comment Seq#035 GBR-P09-101.

7.4 Seq#037 (CAN-P09-014) (RTM-118)

RTM-118 was amended as follows:

a) change items 2.18, 2.19, and 2.20 were withdrawn.

RTM-118 was adopted unanimously as amended and resolves the following ballot comments:

- a) Seq#037 CAN-P09-014
- b) Seq#246 CAN-P09-059 in agenda item 7.21
- c) Seq#299 USA-P09-059 in agenda item 8.4

It was later pointed out that RTM-118 resolved Seq#292 (CAN-P09-093).

6 WG3 Loenen Meeting

7.5 Seq#038 (CAN-P09-015) (RTM-062)

RTM-062 was adopted unanimously and this resolves Seq#038 CAN-P09-015.

7.6 Seq#047 (GBR-P09-013) (RTM-093)

RTM-093 was adopted unanimously and this resolves Seq#047 GBR-P09-013.

7.7 Seq#051 (DEU-P09-009) (RTM-044)

RTM-044 was adopted unanimously and this resolves the following ballot comments:

- a) Seq#051 (DEU-P09-009)
- b) Seq#053 (GBR-P09-014)
- c) Seg#245 (CAN-P09-063)
- d) Seq#269 (CAN-P09-076)

As a result of the discussion of RTM-044, Jim Melton and Paul Cotton drafted RTM-100 which included a SQL99 TC to handle the problem that both SQL/CLI and SQL/Foundation have a clause "Data Correspondence Tables" with the same.

Change item 2.21 with later withdrawn and this has no impact on the resolution of the listed ballot comments.

7.8 Seq#064 (CAN-P09-022) (RTM-098)

RTM-098 was amended as follows:

a) Add a new change proposal item 2.6 that says:

In SQL/MED, Subclause 20.2, "GetDataLinkAttr", GR 12 ("Case"), d ("If A indicates URL PATH, then..."), strike out the trailing text ", and access token of DL" and replace it with "of DL, possibly combined with an access token under the General Rules of Subclause 6.2, "<string value function>".

b) At the end of the paragraph being modified in proposal item 2.2.1, replace the (unchanged!) text "will fail" with "is unsuccessful".

RTM-098 was adopted unanimously as amended and resolves the following ballot comments:

- a) Seq#064 CAN-P02-022
- b) Seq#069 USA-P09-015 see agenda item 7.9
- c) Seq#071 GBR-P09-019 see agenda item 7.10

7.9 Seg#069 (USA-P09-015) (RTM-098)

See agenda item 7.9.

7.10 Seq#071 (GBR-P09-019) (RTM-098)

See agenda item 7.9.

7.11 Seq#085 (GBR-P09-024) (RTM-064)

RTM-064 was adopted unanimously and resolves Seq#085 GBR-P09-024.

7.12 Seq#100a (WG3-P09-003) (RTM-066)

Paul Cotton provided a Possible Problem to the Editor suggesting that the constraints added by RTM-066 should be reflected in the COLUMNS base table in SQL/MED.

RTM-066 was adopted unanimously and this resolves Seq#100a WG3-P09-003.

7.13 Seg#132 (USA-P09-019) (RTM-123)

Several editorial changes were provided including making the AUTHORIZATION <authorization identifier> syntax optional.

RTM-123 was adopted unanimously and resolves

a) Seg#132 USA-P09-019

b) Seq#299e WG3-P09-008 see agenda item 7.37

7.14 Seq#147 (USA-P09-024)

See agenda item 7.2.

7.15 Seq#148 (USA-P09-025)

See agenda item 7.2.

7.16 Seq#149 (USA-P09-026)

See agenda item 7.2.

7.17 Seq#190 (USA-P09-039)

USA moved to resolve the six outstanding ballot comments (Seq#190, Seq#191, Seq#193, Seq#299a, Seq#299d and Seq#299g) by converting them into SQL/MED Possible Problems and that these comments be marked resolved. Seconded by Canada. Adopted unanimously.

7.18 Seq#191 (USA-P09-040)

See agenda item 7.17.

7.19 Seq#193 (USA-P09-042)

See agenda 7.17.

7.20 Seq#236 (CAN-P09-062)

See agenda item 7.2.

7.21 Seq#246 (CAN-P09-064) (RTM-118)

See agenda item 7.4.

7.22 Seq#247 (DEU-P09-027)

See agenda item 7.35.

7.23 Seq#249 (JPN-P09-005)

The meeting agreed that this ballot comment had be resolved by YGJ-067R1.

7.24 Seq#270 (CAN-P09-077) (RTM-114)

RTM-114 was amended as follows:

a) replace the consecutive "and/or"s by a leading phrase "one or more of the ...".

RTM-114 was adopted unanimously as amended and was forwarded to the WG3 meeting for consideration as a TC candidate. Adoption of this comment resolves Seq#270 CAN-P09-077.

7.25 Seg#280 (CAN-P09-084) (RTM-116)

RTM-116 was amended as follows:

- a) the Editor will add a new subclause to SQL/MED to align it with the Columns view in the Short Name Views in the Information Schema,
- b) in the COLUMNS view, the lines references to USER_DEFINED_TYPE_CATALOG, _SCHEMA and _NAME should not be removed.

RTM-116 was adopted unanimously and resolves the following ballot comments:

- a) Seq#280 CAN-P09-084
- b) Seq#283 CAN-P09-087 see agenda item 7.26

It was also pointed out to the Editors that the parenthesis in the SQL-99 COLUMNS view are not balanced. This problem was replicated in RTM-116 but will be fixed editorially.

7.26 Seq#283 (CAN-P09-087) (RTM-116)

See agenda item 7.25.

7.27 Seq#285 (CAN-P09-088) (RTM-107R1)

RTM-107R1 was adopted unanimously and resolves the following ballot comments:

- a) Seq#285 CAN-P09-088
- b) Seq#286 USA-P09-057 see agenda item 7.28
- c) Seq#291 USA-P09-058 see agenda item 7.29

7.28 Seq#286 (USA-P09-057) (RTM-107R1)

See agenda item 7.27

7.29 Seq#291 (USA-P09-058) (RTM-107R1)

See agenda item 7.27.

7.30 Seq#291a (WG3-P09-001) (RTM-106)

RTM-106 was adopted unanimously and this resolves the following ballot comments:

- a) Seq#291a WG3-P09-001
- b) Seq#291b WG3-P03-002 (see agenda item 7.31)

7.31 Seq#291b (WG3-P09-002) (RTM-106)

See agenda item 7.30.

7.32 Seq#297 (JPN-P09-006) (RTM-102)

RTM-102 was adopted unanimously and resolves Seg#297 JPN-P09-006.

7.33 Seq#299a (WG3-P09-004) (RTM-057R1) (RTM-095)

RTM-0057 was adopted unanimously as amended implicitly by the required changes identified in RTM-095.

Krishna Kulkarni provided a revised version of RTM-057 to take into consideration all of the changes identified in RTM-095.

Adopted of RTM-057 resolves points 1, 2 and 3)b of Seq#299a.

RTM-099 to be amended by Krishna Kulkarni was adopted unanimously. RTM-099 partially addresses Seq#299a parts 5, 6 and 7.

Action item: Krishna Kulkarni to provide a revised version of RTM-099 to the Editor for inclusion in the SQL/MED document output from this meeting.

RTM-107R1 resolves Seq#299a part 8 (see agenda item 7.27).

See agenda item 7.17 for final resolution of Seq#299a WG3-P09-004.

7.34 Seq#299b (WG3-P09-005) (RTM-117)

RTM-117 was adopted unanimously and resolves this ballot comment.

7.35 Seq#299c (WG3-P09-006) (RTM-126)

The proposed solution in RTM-126 for Seq#299c was rejected and since this ballot comment was resolved by adopting the Execution Flow Table from RTM-058R2 in combination with RTM-099 and RTM-056R2.

RTM-126 was amended as follows:

a) in change proposal 2.2.1, add a new instruction to modify subclause 23.1 COLUMNS base table to change all instances of columns names beginning DL_ to spell them DATALINK_. (the meeting then remembered that this was already done in RTM-199R2).

It was pointed out Seq#247 DEU-P09-027 was a duplicate of Seq#299L and will be merge into a single Possible Problem.

RTM-126 was adopted as amended and resolves the following ballot comments:

- a) Seq#299f WG3-P09-008 see agenda item 7.38
- b) Seq#299h WG3-P09-011 see agenda item 7.40
- c) Seq#299i WG3-P09-012 see agenda item 7.41
- d) Seq#299j WG3-P09-012 see agenda item 7.42
- e) Seq#2991 WG3-P09-015 see agenda item 7.44
- f) Seq#247 DEU-P09-027 see agenda item 7.22

Action item: Jim Melton will submit an update to Standing Document 4 to provide new rules for naming short named views as per WG3 RTM-126.

7.36 Seq#299d (WG3-P09-007)

See agenda item 7.17.

7.37 Seq#299e (WG3-P09-008)

See agenda item 7.13.

7.38 Seq#299f (WG3-P09-009)

See agenda item 7.35.

7.39 Seg#299g (WG3-P09-010)

See agenda item 7.17.

7.40 Seq#299h (WG3-P09-011)

See agenda item 7.35.

7.41 Seq#299i (WG3-P09-012)

See agenda item 7.35

7.42 Seq#299j (WG3-P09-013)

See agenda item 7.35.

7.43 Seq#299k (WG3-P09-014) (RTM-065)

Amended as follows:

a) in section 2.1, change "every value" to "every non-null value".

Adopted unanimously as amended and this resolves Seq#299k. The Editor was given editorial direction on how to fix the tags in this paper (e.g. several "Insert this GR" tags were made more explicit).

7.44 Seq#299I (WG3-P09-015)

See agenda item 7.35.

7.45 Seq#300 (DEU-P09-032)

Resolved by editorial action. The preferred notation is "... ISO/IEC 9075-x".

8 Resolution of Catch-All Ballot Comments

8.1 Seq#294 (CAN-P09-095)

Deemed resolved since there were no remaining Editor's Notes.

8.2 Seq#295 (CAN-P09-096)

Deemed resolves since there were no remaining Possible Problems from the original ballot comment.

8.3 Seq#296 (CAN-P09-097)

Open due to the existence of new Possible Problems.

8.4 Seq#299 (USA-P09-059)

See agenda item 7.4.

8.5 Seq#298 (USA-P09-060)

Deemed resolved as a duplicate of Seq#296 CAN-P09-097.

8.6 Seq#292 (CAN-P09-093)

See agenda item 7.4.

8.7 Refining the foreign-data wrapper interface (RTM-056R1) (RTM-095)

Krishna Kulkarni tabled a revised version of RTM-056 that responded to all of the specific comments in RTM-095 by Paul Cotton.

RTM-056R1 was adopted unanimously.

Hugh Darwen provided an annotated version of RTM-056R1 with editorial corrections.

8.8 SQL/MED support for "SQL-aware" foreign servers (RTM-058R2)

Jim Melton agreed to add an additional Possible Problem to suggest the possibility of using information in the SQL_Features, SQL_Implementation_Info and SQL_Sizings view in the information returned by the proposed GetOptions() routine.

Adopted unanimously and this partially resolves the following ballot comments:

- a) Seq#193 USA-P09-042
- b) Seq#247 DEU-P09-027
- c) Seq#296 CAN-P09-097
- d) Seq#299g WG3-P09-010
- e) Seq#2991 WG3-P09-015

8.9 Fixing bugs connected with the use <user-defined type> (RTM-046R2)

Section 10 of RTM-046R2 was adopted unanimously to solve a MED problem found during the editing meeting. This partially resolved Seq#292 CAN-P09-093.

See WG3 agenda 9.23 (in WG3 SAF-001).

8.9 <datalink function> revisited and URL revisited (RTM-122)

RTM-122 was adopted unanimously and partially resolves:

- a) Seq#248 GBR-P09-102 (resolved at Matsue editing meeting)
- b) Seq#296 CAN-P09-096 see agenda item 8.3
- c) Seq#298 USA-P09-060 see agenda item 8.5

9 National Body Closing Comments

Canada

Canada is very pleased with the success of the SQL/MED CD continuation editing meeting which succeeded in resolving all of the technical CD ballot comments. Canada especially appreciates the significant contributions provided by the USA and UK during this editing meeting.

Canada looks forward to an FCD ballot for the SQL/MED part of SQL-99 and hopes that we can publish this SQL-99 part by the end of 2000.

Germany

Germany acknowledges the progress made with RTM013 during the Loenen Editing Meeting.

Though the German NB agrees to progress MED to FCD, it should be noted that severe concerns have been voiced against doing so right now. I expect that this fact will translate into a number of critical ballot comments in the forthcoming ballot round.

Germany appreciates the hard work of the participating delegates, the determination for reaching consensus, and the leadership of the convenor who kept the meeting constantly focused.

Japan

Japan believes that emerging SQL/MED features have much possibilities. Japan believes that it is important to keep developing SQL/MED standard. Also, Japan continues to pay effort to develop and check SQL/MED draft.

Netherlands

The Netherlands is pleased with the progress made on the document.

The fact that only 3 original comments are outstanding and that several additional comments found have also been resolved leads us to the conclusion that the output document will be eminently suitable for submission to an FCD ballot.

This is not to suggest that there are no other problems which need to addressed but we believe that an FCD ballot is the best mechanism to ensure that these are identified and resolved in an expeditious manner.

The Netherlands hope that the delegates have now discovered that there is more to the Netherlands than Amsterdam.

United Kingdom

UK is pleased with the progress that has been made during the Loenen round of the SQL/MED CD ballot resolution meeting and with the excellent spirit of collaboration among SQL experts from various national bodies. In our opening comments we expressed concern about the outstanding major technical comments concerning access tokens and about the substantial new technical material being proposed at this meeting. We indicated that we saw these as obstacles to our being able to support submission of the output document from this meeting for an FCD ballot. We also suggested that the timing of the beginning of the FCD ballot resolution meeting would be unaffected by whether we progressed out of Loenen or Santa Fe.

We accept that our point about timing has been refuted. We also accept that the comments concerning access tokens have been satisfactorily addressed. However, the amount of new technical material has been significantly increased during the meeting, as a result of adoption of the proposals in rtm099 (work which is still to be completed).

Having carefully considered all these points, we are willing to support a motion to submit the next draft of SQL/MED for FCD ballot, with a view to starting its ballot resolution meeting in approximately midsummer, 2000.

We thank the convenor, secretary and editor for the smooth running of the meeting and we especially thank Steve Cannan, James Martin Ltd. and Eleanor Cannan for their outstanding hospitality.

USA

USA is quite pleased with the progress made at this Editing meeting in addressing all the remaining ballot comments on SQL/MED. USA sees no problems in changing its vote on the CD ballot to "Yes" to pave the way for progression. USA would like to request the Editing meeting to recommend to progress the output document out of this meeting to FCD ballot. USA is grateful to all the national bodies for working hard to address the ballot comments and to Steve Cannan for chairing the editing meeting and for hosting the meeting in this beautiful location.

10 Recommendations

10.1 Preparation of Revised Texts (SD-005)

The meeting agreed that the priority of the Editor's work after this meeting should be in the following order:

- 1) revised SQL/OLB interim FCD text (ETA Nov 5),
- 2) revised SQL/MED text for possible ballot text (ETA Nov 19 with an optional sneak peek),
- 3) revised OLAP amendment text for possible ballot (ETA Dec 10)
- 4) revised Working Drafts including the OLAP merge (ETA Dec 31).

The following documents will be input to the WG3 meeting to be held in Santa Fe, NM, USA on Jan 17-28, 2000:

Document Prefix: WG3 SAF-

No.	Source	Title
001	Cotton	Minutes from Loenen a/d Vecht WG Meeting
002	Cannan	Technical Corrigendum #4 WD
003	Melton	ISO 9075-1 SQL/Framework WD
004	Melton	ISO 9075-2 SQL/Foundation WD
005	Melton	ISO 9075-3 SQL/CLI WD
006	Melton	ISO 9075-4 SQL/PSM WD
007	Melton	ISO 9075-7 SQL/Temporal WD
008	Melton	ISO 9075-9 SQL/MED WD
009	Melton	ISO 9075-10 SQL/OLB WD
010	Melton	ISO 9075-11 SQL/Schemata WD
011	Melton	ISO 9075 SQL/OLAP WD
012	Melton	Master Index of ISO 9075 WDs
013	Cotton	Minutes of ISO 9075-9 SQL/MED CD Continuation Editing Meeting, Loenen a/d Vecht (SC32 N00366)
014	Cotton	Minutes of ISO 9075-10 SQL/OLB FCD Continuation Editing Meeting, Loenen a/d Vecht (SC32 N00367)

No.	Source	Title
015	Melton	ISO 9075-9 SQL/MED CD Final Disposition of Comments (SC32 N00290)
016	Melton	ISO 9075-10 SQL/OLB FCD Interim Disposition of Comments (SC32 N00291)
017	Melton	ISO 9075-9 SQL/MED FCD text
018	Melton	ISO 9075-10 SQL/OLB Interim FCD text
019	Melton	ISO 9075 SQL/OLAP FPDAM Text

10.2 Disposition of Comments Report

WG3 SAF-013 (these minutes), WG3 RTM-015 (the minutes of the original CD editing meeting), WG3 SAF-015 (Final disposition of comments) and SAF-017 (revised SQL/MED base document) will act as the disposition of Comments Report for the SQL/MED CD editing meeting.

10.3 Recommendation Regarding Progression

Canada proposed that the SQL-99 MED document output from the Loenen continuation editing meeting as WG3 SAF-017 be forwarded to the SC32 Secretariat for FCD ballot to be initiated on or after January 1, 2000. Seconded by Germany.

For: Canada, Japan, Germany, Netherlands, UK, USA

Against: None Abstain: None

Motion carried (6-0-0)

11 Action Items

- 1. Agenda item 7.33 of SAF-013: Krishna Kulkarni to provide a revised version of RTM-099 to the Editor for inclusion in the SQL/MED document output from this meeting.
- 2. Agenda item 7.35 of SAF-013: Jim Melton will submit an update to Standing Document 4 to provide new rules for naming short named views as per WG3 RTM-126.

12 ADJOURN

The SQL/MED CD continuation meeting expresses it thanks to the Netherlands delegation and the sponsoring organizations for its wonderful meeting facilities in Loenen a/d Vecht. The meeting facilities were of the very highest standard and permitted the editing meeting to achieve significant results. The meeting also expressed its gratitude to Chuck Campbell of the USA delegation for providing the local area network used during the meeting.

The meeting adjourned at 3:00 PM on Friday October 15.

Appendix A Final Agenda

SQL/MED CD Continuation Editing Meeting 4th – 15th October, 1999 Loenen a/d Vecht, Netherlands

- 1 Introduction Of Participants
- 2 Distribution Of Documents
- 3 Selection Of Secretary And Resolution Recorder
- 4 Approval Of Agenda
- 5 Administrative Matters
- 5.1 Calling notice for MED Continuation Editing Meeting (SC32 N00316) (RTM-022)
- 5.2 Minutes of ISO 9075-9 SQL/MED CD Editing Meeting, Matsue (SC32 N00288, RTM-015)
- 5.3 CD 9075-9 SQL/MED Interim Text (RTM-013)
- 5.4 CD 9075-9 SQL/MED Interim Disposition of Comments (RTM-017R3)
- 5.5 Convenor's Definition of Consensus
- 6 National Body Opening Comments
- 7 Resolution of Ballot Comments
- 7.1 Seq#011 (USA-P09-001)
- 7.2 Seq#013 (DEU-P09-001)
- Seq#014 (GBR-P09-002)
- Seq#015 (DEU-P09-002)
- Seq#016 (USA-P09-003)
- Seq#048 (CAN-P09-018)
- Seq#049 (CAN-P09-019)
- Seq#050 (DEU-P09-008)
- Seq#052 (DEU-P09-010)
- Seq#054 (USA-P09-011)
- Seg#105 (CAN-P09-009)
- Seq#106 (CAN-P09-030)
- Seq#107 (CAN-P09-031)
- Seq#108 (CAN-P09-032)
- Seg#109 (CAN-P09-033)
- Seq#110 (CAN-P09-034)
- Seq#111 (CAN-P09-036)
- Seq#112 (CAN-P09-038)
- Seq#113 (CAN-P09-039)
- Seg#114 (CAN-P09-040)
- Seq#115 (CAN-P09-041)
- Seg#116 (CAN-P09-042)
- Seq#117 (CAN-P09-043)
- Seq#118 (CAN-P09-044)
- g #110 (CDD D00 022)
- Seq#119 (GBR-P09-032) Seq#120 (GBR-P09-033)
- Seq#121 (GBR-P09-034)
- Seq#122 (GBR-P09-035)
- Seq#123 (GBR-P09-042)
- Seq#124 (GBR-P09-043)
- Seg#125 (GBR-P09-046)
- Seq#126 (GBR-P09-048)
- Seq#127 (GBR-P09-049)
- Seq#128 (GBR-P09-050)

```
Seg#129 (GBR-P09-051)
Seg#130 (GBR-P09-057)
Seq#131 (GBR-P09-060)
Seq#133 (USA-P09-020)
Seq#134 (USA-P09-021)
Seq#135 (USA-P09-034)
Sea#136 (GBR-P09-036)
Seq#137 (GBR-P09-037)
Seg#138 (GBR-P09-038)
Seq#139 (GBR-P09-040)
Seq#140 (GBR-P09-052)
Seg#145 (USA-P09-022)
Seg#146 (USA-P09-023)
Seq#150 (USA-P09-027)
Seq#154 (GBR-P09-047)
Seg#155 (GBR-P09-055)
Seg#156 (USA-P09-031)
Seg#157 (USA-P09-032)
Seq#162 (GBR-P09-044)
Seq#163 (GBR-P09-045) (see comment)
Seg#237 (USA-P09-052)
Seq#238 (DEU-P09-022)
Seq#240 (GBR-P09-094)
Seg#278 (CAN-P09-082) (see also RTM-119R2)
Seq#281 (CAN-P09-085) (see also RTM-044 agenda item 7.7) (see also RTM-115)
Seq#282 (GBR-P09-100) (see also RTM-115)
                       (RTM-045)
7.3 Seq#035 (GBR-P09-101) (RTM-067, RTM-096R1)
7.4 Seg#037 (CAN-P09-014) (RTM-118)
7.5 Seq#038 (CAN-P09-015) (RTM-062)
7.6 Seq#047 (GBR-P09-013) (RTM-093)
7.7 Seq#051 (DEU-P09-009)
Seq#053 (GBR-P09-014)
Seq#245 (CAN-P09-063)
Seq#269 (CAN-P09-076) (RTM-044)
7.8 Seq#064 (CAN-P09-022) (RTM-098)
7.9 Seq#069 (USA-P09-015) (RTM-098)
7.10 Seq#071 (GBR-P09-019) (RTM-098)
7.11 Seq#085 (GBR-P09-024) (RTM-064)
7.12 Seq#100a (WG3-P09-003) (RTM-066)
7.13 Seq#132 (USA-P09-019) (RTM-123)
7.14 Seq#147 (USA-P09-024)
7.15 Seq#148 (USA-P09-025)
7.16 Seq#149 (USA-P09-026)
7.17 Seq#190 (USA-P09-039)
7.18 Seg#191 (USA-P09-040)
7.19 Seq#193 (USA-P09-042)
7.20 Seq#236 (CAN-P09-062)
7.21 Seq#246 (CAN-P09-064) (RTM-118)
7.22 Seq#247 (DEU-P09-027)
7.23 Seg#249 (JPN-P09-005)
7.24 Seq#270 (CAN-P09-077) (RTM-114)
7.25 Seq#280 (CAN-P09-084) (RTM-116)
7.26 Seq#283 (CAN-P09-087) (RTM-116)
```

- 7.27 Seq#285 (CAN-P09-088) (RTM-107R1)
- 7.28 Seg#286 (USA-P09-057) (RTM-107R1)
- 7.29 Seq#291 (USA-P09-058) (RTM-107R1)
- 7.30 Seq#291a (WG3-P09-001) (RTM-106)
- 7.31 Seq#291b (WG3-P09-002) (RTM-106)
- 7.32 Seg#297 (JPN-P09-006) (RTM-102)
- 7.33 Seq#299a (WG3-P09-004) (RTM-057R1, RTM-095, RTM-099)
- 7.34 Seq#299b (WG3-P09-005) (RTM-117)
- 7.35 Seq#299c (WG3-P09-006) (RTM-126)
- 7.36 Seq#299d (WG3-P09-007)
- 7.37 Seg#299e (WG3-P09-008) (RTM-123)
- 7.38 Seq#299f (WG3-P09-009) (RTM-119, RTM-126)
- 7.39 Seq#299g (WG3-P09-010)
- 7.40 Seg#299h (WG3-P09-011) (RTM-126)
- 7.41 Seq#299i (WG3-P09-012) (RTM-126)
- 7.42 Seq#299j (WG3-P09-013) (RTM-126)
- 7.43 Seq#299k (WG3-P09-014) (RTM-065)
- 7.44 Seq#2991 (WG3-P09-015) (RTM-126)
- 7.45 Seq#300 (DEU-P09-032)
- 8 Resolution of Catch-All Ballot Comments
- 8.1 Seq#294 (CAN-P09-095)
- 8.2 Seq#295 (CAN-P09-096)
- 8.3 Seg#296 (CAN-P09-097)
- 8.4 Seg#299 (USA-P09-059) (RTM-118)
- 8.5 Seq#298 (USA-P09-060)
- 8.6 Seq#292 (CAN-P09-093)
- 8.7 Refining the foreign-data wrapper interface (RTM-056R2, RTM-095)
- 8.8 SQL/MED support for "SQL-aware" foreign servers (RTM-058R1)
- 8.9 Fixing bugs connected with the use of <user-defined type> syntax (RTM-046R2)
- 8.10 < datalink value function > and URL revisited (RTM-122)
- 9 National Body Closing Comments
- 10 Recommendations
- 10.1 Preparation of Revised Texts (SD-005)
- 10.2 Disposition of Comments Report
- 10.3 Recommendation Regarding Progression
- 11 Action Items
- 12 Adjourn

Appendix B Document Register

SQL/MED CD Continuation Editing Meeting 4th – 15th October, 1999 Loenen a/d Vecht, Netherlands

Document Prefix: WG3 RTM-

No.	Source	Title	Agenda	Avail.?
001	Cotton	Minutes from Matsue WG Meeting	WG5.1	Y
002R1	Cannan	Technical Corrigendum #4 WD	WG9.1	Y
003	Melton	ISO 9075-1 SQL/Framework WD	WG6.9	Y
004	Melton	ISO 9075-2 SQL/Foundation WD	WG6.18	Y
005	Melton	ISO 9075-3 SQL/CLI WD	WG6.10	Y
006	Melton	ISO 9075-4 SQL/PSM WD	WG6.11	Y
007	Melton	ISO 9075-7 SQL/Temporal WD	WG6.12	Y
008	Melton	ISO 9075-9 SQL/MED WD	WG6.13	Y
009	Melton	ISO 9075-10 SQL/OLB WD	WG6.14	Y
010	Melton	ISO 9075-11 SQL/Schemata WD	WG6.15	Y
011	Melton	ISO 9075 SQL/OLAP WD (SC32 N00292)	WG6.16	Y
012	Melton	Master Index of ISO 9075 WDs	WG6.17	Y
013	Melton	ISO 9075-9 SQL/MED Interim CD text	EM5.2	Y
014	Melton	ISO 9075-10 SQL/OLB Interim FCD text	EO5.3	Y
015	Cotton	Minutes of ISO 9075-9 SQL/MED CD Editing Meeting, Matsue (SC32 N00288)	EM5.2, WG6.21	Y
016	Cotton	Minutes of ISO 9075-10 SQL/OLB FCD Editing Meeting, Matsue (SC32 N00289)	EO5.2, WG6.22	Y
017R3	Melton	ISO 9075-9 SQL/MED CD Interim Disposition of Comments (SC32 N00290)	EM5.4	Y
018	Melton	ISO 9075-10 SQL/OLB FCD Interim Disposition of Comments (SC32 N00291)	EO5.4	Y
019R2	Darwen	Problems with STATIC DISPATCH	WG9.2	Y
020	Darwen	Groundrules for the editorial revision of OLB	EO5.5	Y
021	Cannan	Calling notice for OLB Continuation Editing Meeting (SC32 N0316)	EO5.1	Y
022	Cannan	Calling notice for MED Continuation Editing Meeting (SC32 N0317)	EM5.1	Y
023	Cannan	Calling Notice for SC 32/WG 3 Meeting, Loenen a/d Vecht, The Netherlands (N0022)	WG6.1	Y
024	USA	A correction to <trigger definition=""> (H2-99-247)</trigger>	WG9.4	Y
025	USA	Correcting oversight of character operations on CLOBs (H2-99-248)	WG9.5	Y
026	USA	The case against YGJ-098=RTM-019 (H2-99-250)	WG9.3	Y
027	USA	Minor corrections for OLAP functions (H2-99-251)	WG10.1	Y
028	USA	Cleaning up the SQL4 PPs, Part 2 (H2-99-252)	WG13.1	Y
029	USA	TC for Annex F (H2-99-254)	WG9.6	Y
030	CAN	Classification of SQL-statements in ISO/IEC 9075	WG9.7	Y
031R1	Cannan	Sweetening the CASE statement – the fourth lump	WG11.1	Y
032	Cotton	Parameter markers and the <in predicate=""></in>	WG9.8	Y
033	Pistor	Some editorial corrections	WG9.9	Y
034R1	Pistor	Some nearly editorial corrections	WG9.10	Y
035	Pistor	Fixing TRIGGER_COLUMN_USAGE base table	WG9.11	Y
036R1	Pistor	Correcting major editorial glitches in 11.46	WG9.12	Y
037R1	Pistor	Correcting SQL-statements in GRs of 11.40, <user-defined definition="" type=""></user-defined>	WG9.13	Y
038	Pistor	Minor corrections in <drop column="" definition=""></drop>	WG9.14	Y
039	Panny	TC for <group by="" clause=""></group>	WG9.15	Y
040R1	Sykes	An INTERSECTS predicate for SQL/Temporal	WG16.1	Y
041	Sykes	Clean up of SQL/Temporal Concepts	WG16.2	Y
042R1	Sykes	Minor changes to SQL/Temporal	WG16.3	Y
043	Sykes	Editorial changes to OLAP Concepts	WG10.2	Y

No.	Source	Title	Agenda	Avail.?
044	Darwen/Cot ton	Deleting <datalink length=""></datalink>	ЕМ7.7	Y
045	Darwen	Deleting Abstract LOBs	EM7.2	Y
046R2	USA	Fixing bugs connected with the use of <user-defined type=""> syntax (H2-99-326)</user-defined>	WG9.23, EM8.9	Y
047	USA	Fixing bugs connected with "insertable-into" tables (H2-99-287)	WG9.16	Y
048	USA	Fixing bugs in structured type "based on" rules (H2-99-288)	WG9.17	Y
049	USA	Fixing bugs connected with type-preserving functions (H2-99-289)	WG9.18	Y
050R1	USA	Fixing bugs connected with savepoints (H2-99-290)	WG9.19	Y
051	USA	Fixing bugs connected with <pre><pre></pre></pre>	WG9.20	Y
052R1	USA	TC for <regular expression="" function="" substring=""> (H2-99-308)</regular>	WG9.21	Y
053R2	USA	TC for <joined table=""> CRs (H2-99-309)</joined>	WG9.22	Y
054R2	USA	More OLAP functions and aggregates (H2-99-310)	WG10.3	Y
055	USA	Extensions to windowing (H2-99-311)	WG10.4	Y
056R1	USA	Refining the foreign-data wrapper interface (H2-99-291)	EM8.7	Y
057R1	USA	Handling diagnostics in SQL/MED (H2-99-292)	EM7.33	Y
058R2	USA	SQL/MED support for "SQL-aware" foreign servers (H2-99-314)	EM8.8	Y
059	USA	Global non-non-terminal cleanup: SQL/OLB (H2-99-293)	EO7.39	Y
060	USA	More cleanup: SQL/OLB (H2-99-294)	EO7.16	Y
061	USA	Conformance clause for SQL/OLB (H2-99-313)	EO7.9	Y
062	Darwen	Addressing MED CD Ballot Comment #38	EM7.5	Y
063	Brown	SQL/OLB - Style and other editorial cleanup.	EO7.70	Y
064	Darwen	Claiming MED CD Ballot Comment #85 to Have Been Solved	EM7.11	Y
065	Darwen	Acknowledging The Possible Existence of Nulls in a Datalink Column	EM7.43	Y
066	Darwen	Restricting <datalink control="" definition=""> to Sensible Combinations</datalink>	EM7.12	Y
067	Darwen	Removing Spurious Statement About Datalinks and Foreign Keys	EM7.3	Y
068	Pistor	Correcting "user-defined descriptor"	WG9.24	Y
069	Pistor	Removing a security hole in <trigger definition=""></trigger>	WG9.25	Y
070	Pistor	Relocation of <row subquery=""> related rules</row>	WG9.26	Y
071	W3C	W3C XML Schema Part 1- Structures	WG7.1	Y
072	W3C	W3C XML Schema Part 2 - Datatypes	WG7.2	Y
073	Sykes	Review of Possible Problems in SQL/Temporal	WG16.4	Y
074	Pistor	Concepts Clause clarification regarding construction of trigger state changes	WG9.27	Y
075	Pistor	Correcting some Information/Definition Schema inconsistencies	WG9.28	Y
076	USA	Transactional Statement Support in SQL/OLB	EO7.46,	Y
070	USA	Transactional Statement Support in SQL/OLB	EO7.40, EO7.47, EO7.48,	1
			EO7.49,	
			EO7.50	
077	USA	Alignment with JDBC 2.0 Batch updates in SQL/OLB	EO7.66, EO7.33, EO7.3	Y
078	USA	Alignment with JDBC 2.0 scrollable cursors	EO7.66, EO7.33,	Y
079	USA	User-defined type support in SQL/OLB	EO7.3 EO7.29, EO7.32, EO7.33, EO7.58,	Y
080	WG5	Draft Agenda for WG5 meeting 28-30 Sept 1999	E07.65 WG7.3	Y
081	WG5	Canadina disussion for WG5 support for SQL/MED	WG7.3	Y
082	WG5	Use of X.500 Distinguished Names for security in distributed database systems	WG7.3	Y
083	WG5	Contributions for RDA support of SQL/MED	WG7.3	Y
084	Melton	E-mail on YGJ-110	EO5.5	Y
084	USA	Character set support in SQL/OLB	EO7.21, EO7.22, EO7.23	Y

No.	Source	Title	Agenda	Avail.?
086	USA	Comments on minor changes (RTM-040, RTM-041 and RTM-042)	WG16.1, WG16.2,	Y
087	Cannan	YGJ-113	WG16.3 WG7.3	Y
088	Campbell	WG5 Liaison Report	WG7.3	Y
089	Melton	Possible BNF Error	WG9.29	Y
090	Melton	Error in SQL/CLI EndTran transaction termination value	WG9.30	Y
091	Melton	Distinguishing Between SQLJ Concepts and Tutorial Material	EO7.13	Y
092	USA	Request for interpretation: exceptions in CASE	WG9.31	Y
093	Kulkarni	Resolving GBR-P09-13	EM7.6	Y
094	WG5	CD ISO/IEC SSSS:200y (E) Information technology — Distributed Database Access for SQL	WG7.3	Y
095	Cotton	Canadian comments on RTM-056 and RTM-057	EM8.7, EM7.33	Y
096R1	Cotton	Prohibiting datalink as a foreign key	EM7.3	Y
097	WG5	SC32 N0349	WG7.3	Y
098	Campbell	Resolving CAN-P09-022, USA-P09-015, GBR-P09-019	EM7.8, EM7.9, EM7.10	Y
099	Kulkarni	Handling data retrieval in MED	EM7.33	Y
100	Melton/ Cotton	Separating data type correspondence tables in Foundation and CLI	WG9.32	Y
101	Japan	Clarification of authorization identifiers (resolving #102, 103 OLB)	EO7.62, EO7.63	Y
102	Japan	Solving JPN-P09-006 with no action	EM7.32	Y
103R1	Coyle	Misc. editorial changes for SQL/OLB	EO7.44, EO7.45	Y
104	Campbell	Resolve SQL/OLB Ballot Commemt #085	EO7.1, EO7.55	Y
105r1	Campbell	Resolve SQL/OLB Ballot Comments #008, 017, 024 and 119	EO7.2, EO7.4, EO7.5, EO7.7, EO7.8, EO7.12, EO7.51, EO7.61, EO7.64,	
106	Kulkarni	Resolving WG3-P09-001 and WG3-P09-002	EM7.30, EM7.31	Y
107R1	Cannan	Resolving Seq# 285 and 286 in SQL/MED	EM7.27, EM7.28 EM7.29	Y
108r1	Japan	Minor cleanup to SQL/OLB	EO8.8	Y
109R1	Zemke	OLAP concepts rewrite	WG10.2	Y
110r1	Japan	Addition of rules for assignment to attribute of named iterator (resolving #061)	EO7.35	Y
111	WG5	Minutes	WG7.3	Y
112R2	Melton	Response to WG5 editor with reagrd to RTM-113	WG7.3	Y
113	WG5	Distribution schema for remote Database Access	WG7.3	Y
114	Cannan	Resolving Seq# 270 in SQL/MED	EM7.24, WG9.33	Y
115	Darwen	Adding DATALINK D_T_D	EM7.2	Y
116	Darwen	Aligning COLUMNS with SQL:1999	EM7.25, EM7.26	Y
117	Darwen	Closing 299b as L.O.	EM7.34	Y
118	Darwen	Aligning SQL/MED with SQL:1999	EM7.4, EM7.21, EM8.4	Y
119R2	Zemke	Information Schema for MED	EM7.2, EM7.38	Y

No.	Source	Title	Agenda	Avail.?
120r1	Melton	Liaison Response to WG5	WG7.3	Y
121R1	Coyle	Proposeed OLB Ballot Comment Resolutions	EO8.9	Y
122	Brown	<datalink function="" value="">and URL revisited</datalink>	EM8.10	Y
123	Cannan	Privileges in MED	EM7.13, EM7.37	Y
124	Campbell	Solving OLB #48	EO7.25	n/a
125	Darwen	Attachment to RTM-103 (example mark-up)	EO7.44, EO7.45	Y
126	Melton	Short name views	EM7.35, EM7.40, EM7.41, EM7.42, EM7.44, EM7.38	Y